

CONFIDENTIAL

ANNEX A

Table of Contents

INTRODUCTION	3
CONFIDENTIALITY LEVEL	3
I. STANDARD OF REVIEW AND SUBSTANTIATION OF ARGUMENTS	4
I.A. Factual errors should be assessed by a deferential standard of reasonableness	4
I.B. Appeal proceedings are not concerned with all errors	10
I.C. The appellant must sufficiently substantiate his or her appeal	11
II. NTAGANDA HAD A FAIR AND EXPEDITIOUS TRIAL (GROUND 2)	13
II.A. <i>Ex Parte</i> submissions were minimal, adequately safeguarded, and fair	13
II.A.1. Chambers have limited discretion to receive <i>ex parte</i> submissions	13
II.A.2. The Chamber properly maintained the <i>ex parte</i> status of certain submissions	14
II.A.3. Ntaganda suffered no prejudice by <i>ex parte</i> submissions to which he since received access	15
II.A.3.a. Submissions concerning P-0768 are unfounded	16
II.A.3.b. Submissions concerning P-0055 are speculative and unfounded	16
II.B. The timing of disclosure of Ntaganda's own non-privileged conversations was not an abuse of process	17
II.B.1. The Prosecution was authorised to access Ntaganda's non-privileged conversations to investigate suspected article 70 offences	17
II.B.2. Records of Ntaganda's non-privileged conversations were not initially disclosable	18
II.B.3. The Chamber properly rejected Ntaganda's request to stay proceedings	20
II.B.4. Material from Ntaganda's non-privileged conversations was used restrictively	21
II.C. The procedure for the 'no case to answer' appeal was correct and fair	22
II.C.1. The Chamber reasonably declined to order a temporary stay	22
II.C.2. There was a case to answer, of which Ntaganda was fully informed	23
II.C.3. Ntaganda made an informed choice to testify, assisted by counsel	24
II.D. Ntaganda had a fair hearing	25
II.D.1. The Chamber properly ordered a limited postponement of the start of trial	25
II.D.2. The Chamber adequately addressed the suspension of a Defence investigator	27
II.D.3. The Chamber took appropriate measures to ensure the integrity of the trial	28
II.D.4. The Chamber properly modified the witness schedule	29
II.D.5. The Chamber reasonably exercised its discretion under article 82(1)(d)	32
III. THE UPC CONDUCTED AN ATTACK DIRECTED AGAINST A CIVILIAN POPULATION (GROUND 5)	33
III.A. The existence of legitimate military operations is immaterial	33
III.B. The Chamber considered evidence of any military purpose	34
III.C. The civilian population was the primary object of the attack	35
III.D. The Chamber correctly assessed the evidence of the military operations	36
III.E. The UPC issued orders to attack civilians	37
III.E.1. 'Kupiga na kuchaji' was an instruction to attack all Lendu	37
III.E.2. Orders were issued to attack civilians	39

IV. THE ATTACK WAS COMMITTED PURSUANT TO AN ORGANISATIONAL POLICY (GROUND 4)	41
IV.A. The Chamber correctly applied the law	42
IV.B. The Chamber made reasonable factual findings	44
V. NTAGANDA WAS PROPERLY CONVICTED OF ORDERING DISPLACEMENT AS A WAR CRIME (GROUND 6)	48
V.A. Territorial control is not a legal element of article 8(2)(e)(viii)	48
V.B. Ntaganda ordered the displacement of civilians	49
V.C. The Chamber's harmless errors in interpreting the <i>actus reus</i> of article 8(2)(e)(viii)	50
VI. THE CHAMBER PROPERLY ASSESSED THE EVIDENCE (GROUND 7)	52
VI.A. The Chamber properly assessed Ntaganda's testimony	52
VI.A.1. The Chamber applied the correct standards in law and in fact	53
VI.B. The Chamber properly assessed D-0017's evidence	57
VI.C. The Chamber correctly relied on P-0022 and P-0027	58
VII. THE UPC AND HEMA CIVILIANS COMMITTED CRIMES DURING THE FIRST OPERATION (GROUND 8)	61
VII.A. Ntaganda misunderstands evidentiary principles	61
VII.A.1. Assessing accomplice evidence	61
VII.A.2. Assessing corroboration	62
VII.B. The UPC committed crimes during its attack on Nzebi	64
VII.B.1. The Chamber correctly found that P-0768 was credible	64
VII.B.2. The Chamber correctly relied on P-0768's evidence on the Nzebi attack	66
VII.C. Ntaganda murdered <i>Abbé</i> Boniface Bwanalanga	67
VII.D. Ntaganda ordered the use of anti-personnel mines in Mongbwalu	68
VII.E. The UPC attacked the Mongbwalu civilian population	70
VII.F. Ntaganda ordered firing at persons wearing civilian clothing	71
VII.G. Ntaganda ordered the killing of two persons detained at the <i>Appartements</i>	73
VIII. CHILDREN UNDER THE AGE OF 15 YEARS WERE IN NTAGANDA'S ESCORT (GROUND 9)	76
VIII.A. The Chamber properly relied on several types of corroborating evidence	76
VIII.B. The Chamber properly relied on video images	77
VIII.C. The Chamber properly relied on age determinations made by witnesses	79
VIII.C.1. The Chamber reasonably assessed P-0898's credibility	79
VIII.C.2. The Chamber reasonably assessed P-0010's credibility	80
VIII.C.3. The Chamber reasonably relied on age assessments made by other witnesses	82
IX. P-0883 AND P-0898 WERE UNDER 15 YEARS OF AGE (GROUND 10)	83

IX.A. P-0883 was under 15 years of age	83
IX.B. P-0898 was under 15 years of age.....	84
X. CHILD SOLDIERS WERE RAPED AND ENSLAVED (GROUND 11)_____	86
X.A. The nine year old girl named Nadège was raped	86
X.B. P-0883 was raped and sexually enslaved	88
X.C. Mave was raped and sexually enslaved.....	89
XI. NTAGANDA HAD THE REQUISITE <i>MENS REA</i> FOR THE CRIMES AGAINST CHILD SOLDIERS UNDER 15 (GROUND 12) _____	91
XII. THE CHAMBER CORRECTLY CONVICTED NTAGANDA AS AN INDIRECT CO-PERPETRATOR (GROUND 13) _____	93
XII.A. The common plan as found accorded with the charges	93
XII.B. The common plan was properly established on the evidence	94
XII.B.1. The Chamber's findings were properly based on direct and circumstantial evidence	94
XII.B.2. The Chamber correctly considered the totality of the evidence.....	95
XII.B.2.a. The case law cited by Ntaganda is inapposite.....	95
XII.B.2.b. The Chamber relied on a range of appropriate factors.....	96
XII.B.2.c. The Chamber correctly assessed the June 2002 meetings in Kampala	98
XII.B.3. The existence of the common plan was also supported by other factual findings	100
XII.C. The common plan entailed the charged crimes.....	101
XII.D. The enlistment, conscription and use of child soldiers, and their rape and sexual slavery were virtually certain to occur	102
XII.E. Ntaganda is responsible for the crimes of the Hema civilians	102
XIII. NTAGANDA HAD THE REQUISITE <i>MENS REA</i> FOR CRIMES COMMITTED DURING THE FIRST OPERATION (GROUND 14) _____	104
XIII.A. The Chamber correctly assessed Ntaganda's <i>mens rea</i>	104
XIII.B. The Chamber reasonably relied on P-0010's evidence on Ntaganda's ' <i>kupiga na kuchaji</i> ' order ..	105
XIII.C. The Chamber reasonably relied upon P-0768's evidence on Ntaganda's order.....	109
XIII.D. The Chamber correctly assessed relevant factors to find Ntaganda's <i>mens rea</i>	110
XIII.E. Ntaganda's <i>mens rea</i> was the only reasonable conclusion on the evidence.....	111
XIV. NTAGANDA HAD THE REQUISITE <i>MENS REA</i> FOR THE CRIMES COMMITTED DURING THE SECOND OPERATION (GROUND 15) _____	113
XIV.A. The Chamber correctly applied the law on indirect co-perpetration.....	113
XIV.B. Ntaganda contributed to, and had the requisite <i>mens rea</i> for, the crimes of the Second Operation 117	
XIV.B.1. The Chamber properly assessed Ntaganda's contributions and <i>mens rea</i>	117
XIV.B.2. Ntaganda contributed to and had the requisite <i>mens rea</i> for the Second Operation.....	120
XIV.B.3. The Chamber properly relied on P-0055 regarding Ntaganda's reaction to the Kobu massacre ..	123
CONCLUSION _____	126